

## **Procedure for Modifying the Elite Journal List**

### **Policy 131**

**Approved: June 13, 2018**

The Pamplin Elite Journal list is a list of the highest reputation journals in the core disciplines in the Pamplin College of Business. The primary role of the Pamplin Elite Journal list is to help enhance the reputation of the Pamplin College of Business. Elite faculties define the elite journals in each field and therefore the Pamplin Elite Journal should reflect the journals recognized by the top business schools in each discipline as elite.

The Pamplin Elite Journal list defines the journals for which acceptances of articles make faculty eligible for the Pamplin Faculty Summer Research Grant Program detailed in [Policy 135](#). The Pamplin Elite Journal list also informs promotion and tenure deliberations contributing to framing discussions of disciplinary research excellence and building national and international research reputation. As noted in [Policy 420](#), acceptance of articles for publication in the Pamplin Elite Journal List is a requirement for promotion and tenure.

Primary evidence that a journal deserves to be included in the Pamplin Elite Journal list is that a preponderance of peer and aspirational schools in a core Pamplin discipline recognize the journal as elite--in the top-tier of journals for that discipline. Additional supporting evidence might include among other evidence a journal's annual total citations counts, journal impact factors, overall submission acceptance rate, and inclusion of journals on field or disciplinary lists of high quality journals (e.g., UT Dallas). However, while useful, these forms of evidence are not sufficient to justify adding a journal on the Pamplin Elite List in the absence of evidence that a journal is considered elite by peer or aspirant universities in the discipline.

### **Reviewing the Elite Journal List**

Reviews of the journals on the Pamplin Elite Journal list will occur from time to time, usually once every five years. The decision to review the elite journal list is made by the dean. When this occurs a review timeline will be issued to guide the process. When modifications to the list are considered, it is expected that only a limited number of high quality journals will be considered and actual changes to the list will likely involve a very small number of journals.

The process to review the Pamplin Elite Journal list begins with a request from the Associate Dean for Research and Faculty Affairs to departments requesting the names of journals the department feels meet the college's reputational standards justifying a journal's inclusion on the Pamplin Elite Journal list. Supporting evidence should accompany each proposed change to the list (i.e., additions or deletions). Department recommendations, in accordance with department processes, which must reflect at

least a simple majority of tenure-track faculty, are forwarded to the Associate Dean for Research and Faculty Affairs for review.

The Associate Dean reviews evidence on the merits of the journals put forward by the departments and develops a consolidated recommendation that addresses each journal. The Associate Dean may not create new recommendations. However, the Associate Dean may share any issue or concern raised during the review with the relevant department faculty for their consideration. The consolidated recommendation, along with all supporting documentations and comments from the Associate Dean for Research and Faculty Affairs, is forwarded to the Academic Committee.

A subcommittee of the Academic Committee consisting of all department heads reviews the recommendation from the Associate Dean and votes on each suggested change to the journal list in accordance with criteria identified above. Changes recommended by a majority vote of the subcommittee are forwarded to the dean for his consideration. Changes not recommended by the subcommittee are also separately forwarded to the dean for his information. In the case of a unanimous vote of the subcommittee, no supporting letter is required. In all other cases, the subcommittee creates a letter detailing those concerns. This letter, including the vote of the subcommittee is forwarded, with all previously generated supporting information to the dean.

Final decisions regarding changes to the elite list rest with the dean who has the capacity to approve or reject the recommendations individually or in full. The dean reports his decision in a letter that is distributed to the faculty. If the review results in changes to the Pamplin Elite Journal List, the effective date of the changes is determined, and the revised Pamplin Elite Journal list is posted to the Pamplin College website. The date when an article accepted in a journal removed from the elite list is no longer considered elite is to be set in a manner that attempts to avoid negative consequences for faculty who, at the time of the decision to remove the journal from the elite list, have manuscripts targeted to this journal in their active research pipeline.